DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 431 963 CE 078 995

TITLE	Career Issues in HRD.
PUB DATE	1999-03-00
NOTE	34p.; In: Academy of Human Resource Development (AHRD) Conference Proceedings; see CE 078 963.
PUB TYPE	Reports - Research (143) -- Speeches/Meeting Papers (150)
EDRS PRICE	EDRS Price MF01 Plus Postage. PC Not Available from EDRS.
DESCRIPTORS	Adult Education; Attitude Measures; *Career Development; Corporations; *Employed Women; Factor Analysis; Foreign Countries; *Labor Force Development; Nonprofit Organizations; Professional Associations; Professional Development; Statistical Analysis; Test Reliability; Test Validity; Trend Analysis; Work Attitudes
IDENTIFIERS	*Career Orientations Inventory; Chief Executive Officers; *Expatriate Executives; Singapore; United Kingdom; United States

ABSTRACT

This document contains four symposium papers on career issues in human resource development (HRD). "Are Careers What They Used To Be: A Factor Analysis of Schein's Career Orientations Inventory" (Gerri Mukri, Sharon Confessore) is a statistical analysis of Schein's Career Orientations Inventory that finds the inventory to be a statistically reliable and valid tool for determining career anchors. "Women's Professional Organizations: Their Potential Role in Women's Careers" (Sheila Barry-Oliver, Sharon J. Confessore) is an exploratory qualitative study of how professional organizations affected the careers of 16 women in leadership positions in diverse fields, organizations, and career stages. Issues in the development of a "new balance" between the self-interests of women chief executive officers (CEOs) in British nonprofit corporations are explored in "Non-profits and Women CEOs' Careers" (Jenny Harrow, Veronica Mole). "Career Development of Expatriate Managers: An International HRD Issue for Singapore-Based Companies" (AAhad M. Osman-Gani, Gerald Z.D. Huang) presents some empirical information for a recent study of expatriate development in Singapore and argues that expatriate career development has yet to receive proper attention in the international HRD literature. (MN)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED 431 963

31 **Career Issues in HRD**

Chair: Larry M. Dooley, Texas A&M University

31-1 Are Careers What they Used to be: A Factor Analysis of Schein's Career Orientations Inventory

Gerri Murki, US Naval School of Health Science

Sharon J. Confessore, George Washington University

31-2 Women's Professional Organizations: Their Potential Role in Women's Careers

Shelia Barry-Oliver, George Washington University

Sharon J. Confessore, George Washington University

31-3 Non-profits and Women CEOs' Careers

Jenny Harrow, South Bank University, United Kingdom

Veronica Mole, South Bank University , United Kingdom

31-4 Career Development of Expatriate Managers: An International HRD Issue for Singapore-Based Companies

AAhad M. Osman-Gani, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore

Gerald Z. D. Huang, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

G Murki J Harrow
S Barry-Oliver A Osman-Gani

2A

CE 078 555

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Are Careers What They Used To Be: A Factor Analysis Of Schein's Career Orientations Inventory

Gerri Mukri
CAPT, Nurse Corps, United States Navy

Sharon Confessore
George Washington University

This study provided a statistical analysis of Schein's 40 item Career Anchor Orientation Inventory Tool. Participants were randomly selected and data collection accomplished by mailed survey (n = 268). Eight reliable factors were identified that closely matched the eight factors identified by Schein as career anchors. Eigen values were all greater than 1 and reliability testing, using Cronbach alpha was good. Overall, Schein's tool was found to be statistically reliable and valid to, in part, determine career anchors.

Keywords: Career Anchors, Career Orientation Inventory, Evaluation

Career development has been identified as a life-long process, which involves the development of attitudes, values and capabilities that lead to future occupational choice (Super, 1990). Today, there are profound changes occurring in the workplace and within organizations worldwide. "These changes in the occupational environment have implications for career development in the future" (Schein, 1996, p. 80). Everyone who works is experiencing changes never imagined. Technological advances and globalization are but two major factors that have revolutionized the workplace. Recent changes have introduced a whole new vocabulary to describe and define what is taking place in the workplace. Activities and business initiatives such as rightsizing, downsizing, job sharing, downshifting, re-engineering and the virtual office are commonplace. As adults mature, a major consideration involves the changes in self-concept and identity when the individual faces marriage, parenthood, career advancement, decline, retirement, illness and widowhood. Factors such as age, gender, race, personal characteristics and economic condition influence the extent to which various life roles are fulfilled, and the recognition of the interconnectedness of these life roles has begun to change the nature of career and life planning.

While individuals have always been focused on career development, the past ten years has seen a major shift in the way that people view their careers, with increasing emphasis on an interconnectedness between their personal values, their work life and career goals. Many organizations are scaling back or eliminating their career planning and development activities as a way to cut costs, and expecting the individual to take on more of the responsibility for career management. A frequently cited condition in today's workplace is that no employment is constant, and organizations, as well as individuals, must be always ready to meet the changing needs of today's work culture. With less career support from organizations, self-assessment vehicles are vital to helping individuals understand their relationship with their careers, organizations and personal commitments.

One means for framing career development is through the use of Schein's Career Anchor Instrument (1990). The career anchor concept is based on developmental principles of career choice. Schein asserts that as an individual progresses through the developmental stages of a career and enters the establishment state, which is generally after 10 years of working life, one develops a clear occupational self-concept. Schein labels this occupational self-concept as a "career anchor." It is composed of the self-perceived talents, motives and values of the individual and:

> ... embraces some explicit answers to the questions:1) What are my talents, skills, areas of competence?; What are my strengths and what are my weaknesses?; 2) What are my main motives, drives, goals in life? What am I after?; 3) What are my values, the main criteria by which I judge what I am doing, whether I am in the right kind of organization or job, how good I feel about what I am doing? (Schein, 1982, p. 8).

Once an individual clearly recognizes these talents, motives and values, the need for congruence makes one seek consistency and integration among the different elements until a complete self-image is realized (Schein, 1982).

Copyright © 1999 Gerri Mukri, Sharon Confessore

While the individual's occupational self-concept matures, it begins to function as a guide in career decision-making as it drives, constrains, or stabilizes the person in making career choices, thus, the anchor metaphor (Schein, 1978).

Problem Statement

Overall, the importance of understanding the way individuals view their careers is increasing, but research in the area of careers has not kept pace with, and has even been hindered by, the rapid changes in the workplace. Much of the early discussion of careers dealt with the concept of fit between such things as the individual's skills, personalities and abilities and those required by the job or environment/organization (Holland, 1985; Parsons, 1909; Williamson, 1965). However, the work environment is changing so rapidly that these conceptualizations may not well represent contemporary career development.

Specifically, career counselors have incorporated use of Schein's career anchor instrument career anchors, into their practice of advising individuals and organizations as they address individual career goals and organizational employment needs. Unfortunately, while Schein's Career Orientations Inventory is widely used as a self-assessment tool, little research has been done to validate that instrument. Thus, there is little empirical evidence to draw on to help people make these decisions, a problem exacerbated by the sweeping changes in the workplace over the 15-20 years since Schein's initial work, and subsequent follow-up studies were completed. Thus, the problem to be addressed is whether the constructs represented by the career anchors inventory are valid and reliable.

Research Question

Is the Career Anchors Orientation Inventory Scale, developed by Schein, a valid and reliable tool to determine the career anchor for particular individual's within a selected sample and population?

Theoretical Framework

The multidimensional approach to career development took shape as researchers incorporated the broader dimensions of personality variables with developmental theory. Particularly important was the multidimensional approach to careers evidenced in the work of Super (1957). It is commonly accepted that Super's developmental self-concept theory of vocational behavior has been credited as uniquely successful in integrating the occupational psychology approach with the evolutionary process approach of developmental career psychology.

Flowing from the work of Super, other researchers have adopted a multidimensional approach to career development which extends career development theory to include later career stages and new relationships. Schein devised an integrated approach to career development using a description of nine career stages (Schein, 1975, 1978, 1980, 1982, 1987, 1990). These are an adaptation and elaboration of the career stages introduced in the seminal work by Super. The nine stages are: (1) growth, fantasy, exploration; (2) education and training; (3) entry into the world of work; (4) basic training, socialization; (5) gaining membership; (6) gaining of tenure, permanent membership, mid-career crisis, reassessment; (7) maintaining momentum, regaining it or leveling off; (8) disengagement and (9) retirement. Career stages 4, 5 and 6 are seen to be of particular interest to the study of career development as they relate to the organization and the individual. It is during these stages, which are generally characterized by an individual's establishment in the organization, that a person develops an occupational self-concept which has been termed by Schein as a "career anchor" (1975).

As an integrated model of career choice, the career anchor concept is considered unique in that it represents a synthesis of an individual's self-image and work experience. Concerning this uniqueness, Schein (1978) emphasized five central factors, which are inherent to the career anchor concept. The career anchor concept is:

1. Broader than the concept of job value or motivation because it accounts for the individual's self-perceived abilities and talents based on actual work experience and the individual's motives/values.
2. Not possible to predict from tests because the emphasis is on actual work experience that allows for the evolution, development and discovery of individual career anchors.
3. A gradual integration of values, motives, and abilities into the person's total self-concept.
4. Only discovered over a number of years during the early career when real-life situations indicate how the person's abilities, values and motives interact with and fit the career options available.

5. Identified with a growing area of personal stability without implying that the individual ceases to grow or change in other areas.

These career anchors describe how the individual views his/her career. The original study that formed the basis of the career anchor concept was a longitudinal study reported by Schein (1974). That research project was conducted to gain a better understanding of how managerial careers evolved, and how managers were socialized into the work setting. Subjects were 44 male graduates from the Sloan School of Management, who were monitored via periodic interviews over a 10-12 year time span. Although the job histories of the alumni differed, there was a high degree of consistency in the reasons given for their individual career decisions. On the basis of this consistency in career decisions, the following five career anchors were identified: managerial competence; technical/functional competence; organizational security; creativity (entrepreneurial); and autonomy. In a final report on this study, Schein stated that "careers are motivated in different ways and organizations must consider these differences in planning career development" (1975, p. 1). Because of the demonstrated stability in the participants' career anchors, Schein (1978) posited that career anchors would become increasingly stable over time. Over time and with further research, such as that performed by Applin (1982) and Burnstine (1982), who identified lifestyle as a potential career anchor, the original five career anchors have been expanded into eight classifications which now include, in addition to the first five: service, pure challenge and lifestyle (Schein, 1990, 1992). To date, Schein's career anchors have been utilized with many diverse populations including federal managers (Barth, 1993), teachers (Delong 1982), and certified public accountants (Hardin, 1995).

Methodology

This study tested the reliability and validity of Schein's Career Anchor Orientations Inventory instrument scale. This scale is the first part of the process that Schein describes to determine an individual's career anchor. A tentative career anchor can be identified by using the inventory scale alone, but must also be compared with the findings in the other steps in the process to determine an individual's true career anchor. While the original concept of the career anchor was developed based on individuals in the business administration field, subsequent refinement of the concept was achieved by studying subjects from a variety of career fields. The sample subjects for this study were drawn from a randomly selected group of nurses who had 10 or more years of work experience and, according to Schein, should have developed a sense of their career anchors. Nurses were selected as a convenience sample. Further, this population was selected to see if their career anchor selection had remained constant in the 1990's when compared with what had been described earlier in the 1980's. The participants were mailed a survey which contained: (1) a demographic survey, (2) a short answer questionnaire focused on career choices and preferences based on Schein's interview format; (3) Schein's Career Orientations Inventory (40 questions organized around a six-point Likert scale), and (4) a career anchor description list for the subjects to prioritize, based on the individual's personal perception of job importance. There was an overall return rate of 60.2% (271 surveys), and of those 268 (59.6%) were usable.

Questions on Schein's Career Orientations Inventory scale were answered based on a six-point Likert scale. Respondents were asked to indicate how "true" each item was for them personally using this scale. A "1" corresponded to the statement never being true for them, while a "6" indicated the statement was always true for them. Following the information provided by Schein (1990), after the 40 items were answered, individuals were then asked to go back over their answers and to circle three of the items which they had awarded the highest point value, and which they deemed were the most applicable to themselves. These three items were then weighted by assigning them four additional points on the coding sheet. Using the scoring sheet provided, the column with the highest point value initially indicated the individual's potential career anchor.

To provide additional insight and understanding of career development in the 1990's respondents were also asked to complete several short answer questions. These questions were designed to correspond very closely to the developmental questions provided by Schein in his Career Anchors publication. Participants completed questions related to career goals, demographic characteristics, and general information regarding the career anchor concept. These answers were analyzed qualitatively after the factor analysis had been completed.

Because the Career Orientation Inventory has had limited validation, a factor analysis with varimax rotation, and a reliability analysis using Cronbach's alpha as a model of internal consistency were also performed on the data. The statistical analysis was performed using the computer statistical package SPSS.

Results, Conclusions and Limitations

Eleven factors were identified, but only eight had high eigenvalues. Questions loaded on six factors that corresponded very closely with the questions that Schein identified for six of the career anchors, with moderate to high factor loading. Questions also loaded on another 2 factors, which closely reflected Schein's structure. The rotation converged in 10 iterations. Tables 1 and 2 display the career anchor structure, associated questions and absolute value scores.

Table 1 Confirmed Career Anchors Using Schein's Structure

Factor 1	*Eigenvalue 5.295*	*Absolute Value Score*
Autonomy	Question 3	.549
	Question 11	.673
	Question 19	.699
	Question 27	.771
	Question 35	.570
Factor 2	*Eigenvalue 3.617*	
Challenge	Question 7	.667
	Question 15	.736
	Question 23	.711
	Question 31	.632
	Question 39	.508
Factor 3	*Eigenvalue 3.038*	
General Manager	Question 2	.400
	Question 10	.620
	Question 18	.820
	Question 26	.659
	Question 34	.701
Factor 4	*Eigenvalue 2.670*	
Lifestyle	Question 8	.619
	Question 16	.631
	Question 24	.666
	Question 32	.505
	Question 40	.471
Factor 5	*Eigenvalue 2.306*	
Security	Question 4	.500
	Question 12	.501
	Question 20	.707
	Question 28	.641
	Question 36	.627
Factor 6	*Eigenvalue 1.972*	
Service	Question 6	.434
	Question 14	.588
	Question 22	.686
	Question 30	.675
	Question 38	.664
Factor 7	*Eigenvalue 1.713*	
Technical	Question 1	.436
	Question 9	.528
	Question 17	.516
	Question 33	.357
Factor 8	*Eigenvalue 1.527*	
Entrepreneurial	Question 5	.707
	Question 13	.764
	Question 37	.835

Table 2 Other Identified Factors

			Questions are identified by Schein as related to the following career anchors
Factor 9	Question 21	.437	Entrepreneurial
Eigenvalue 1.317	Question 29	.434	Entrepreneurial
Factor 10	Question 6	.405	Service
Eigenvalue 1.051	Question 30	.339	Service
Factor 11	Question 25	.644	Technical/Functional
Eigenvalue 1.000	Question 34	.308	General Manager
	Question 40	.309	Lifestyle

Factor seven, which corresponded to the technical/functional career anchor, only moderately loaded on four of the five questions, and factor eight (entrepreneurial) loaded high on only three of the five questions. The other two questions, (#21 and 29) identified by Schein as relating to the entrepreneurial career anchor, also loaded on the factors related to autonomy and challenge career anchors. In addition, those two questions identified a separate factor (factor #9). The other two factors (#10 and #11) identified very weak or weak factor loadings, except for Question 25 (.644). The eigenvalues, which refers to the ability of all the questions in a particular factor to better explain the construct instead of a single item, were all above 1 which is the accepted value to demonstrate the contribution of the factor to the total communality (Ferguson, 1981). Due to low eigenvalues and low factor loading, factors 9, 10 and 11 were not considered in this study. The results are displayed in Table 2.

As a check for internal consistency and reliability a Cronbach Alpha was performed. This is the most appropriate type of reliability for survey research when there is a range of possible answers for each item (McMillan and Schumacher, 1997). Results of the reliability assessment are summarized in Table 3, and were very consistent with an earlier study done by Hardin (1995) that looked at certified public accountants. Technical/Functional career anchor scale has a moderate reliability coefficient while the other scales have a high degree of reliability. In summary, the factor structure for this data is very similar to Schein's (1990), and the reliability is good and acceptable.

Table 3 Internal Consistency Reliability Test Results

Career Anchors	Coefficient Alpha
Technical/Functional	.5297
General Managerial	.7589
Autonomy	.8009
Security	.7251
Entrepreneurial	.7788
Service	.7428
Challenge	.7989
Lifestyle	.7323

Thus, it was determined that the Career Orientation Inventory could be utilized with confidence as there was a good degree of consistency, and meaningfulness of design with Schein's overall factor structure for the eight career anchors. Even though the entrepreneurial career anchor had only three questions loaded within that factor, the loading was very high. There was also a high degree of reliability on seven of the eight career anchors, and moderately high on the other career anchor.

While factorial invariance was not completely achieved, the overall factor structure of Schein's instrument was proven to be sound. Perhaps the inability to achieve closer factorial statistics could in part be attributable to the difference in populations as well as the fact that this is a constantly evolving and changing environment. All eight career anchors were found to have reliable internal consistency. Overall, Schein's Career Anchor Orientations Inventory is statistically a fairly reliable and valid tool to determine career anchors.

However, the changes in the workplace, and in language usage would seem to have an impact on the individual's ability to complete the inventory, and a concern with specific terminology is noted. Many of the terms used in the inventory, or to describe the career anchors for prioritization, are emotionally charged words which seem to elicit a response which may not be consistent with the original intention of the intended item. The items from the short answer responses indicated that the verbiage used to describe the career anchors might have an impact on the individual's choice of answer more than the actual concept behind the description. An example of this difference follows: in today's work environment, the terms "flexibility" and "risk-taking" are considered more desirable attributes than they were in the 1980's. Also, certain words seem to have taken on new meanings in that words such as empowerment, risk-taking, innovation and other highly charged words are used during motivational speeches, and appear on slogans or performance appraisals. All of these terms tend to provoke a response that may not be in keeping with the career-related concept intended. Some of the possible distortion may be due to an organizational or ethic cultural interpretation, a change in the contemporary use of a word, or a change in today's workplace perspective. Another consideration is that the wording on the questions, in particular #33 which refers to using your skills in your job, may be too general for today's specializations. In today's workplace, all individuals are required to have some type of technical competence in order to do their jobs, and thus should perhaps be accounted for in the Schein Career Anchor instrument.

This study furthered the developmental theory of careers by confirming the existence of career anchors, as well as providing additional evidence of construct validity and reliability for the Career Anchor Orientation Inventory established by Schein (1990). While this study confirmed the career anchor construct, there is still much room for speculation and controversy surrounding the construct and in particular the lifestyle career anchor. The findings from this study support the existence of the lifestyle anchor. They also suggest that the instrument can continue to be used, with caution, as people formulate their careers in the late 1990s.

That, within this population, the lifestyle was the predominate anchor supports the increased interest and emphasis in the literature on integration of life and workplace values. The respondents, who identified very strongly with their organizational culture, clearly articulated the importance of family and revealed a strong concern with the meeting the needs of the family while maintaining careers. Most surprising was the interest and value individuals gave to a "higher being" in determining the value in their lives, and assessing which career choices would be best for themselves and their families.

It should be noted that the results of this study are limited due to the specific pool from which the subjects were drawn (the Navy and nurses) and their voluntary participation in a survey process. Further, while the concept of the career anchor is firmly established in the HRD field, the factor structure for the Career Orientation Inventory has not been widely tested.

How This Research Contributes to New Knowledge in HRD

Career decisions and planning, while ultimately the responsibility of the individuals involved, have become a significant function of HRD professionals, and the organizations they serve. This increased emphasis is due, in large part, to downsizing efforts and associated job placement counseling/services, and job reengineering. Part of the process that HRD professionals employ is self-assessment. This is a critical component of career strategies that is geared toward professional self-fulfillment. Over 16 years ago, Yankelovich (1981) stated that "new-value" workers search for self-fulfillment in their work, rather than simply working for pay. This study of career anchors, which is based on an individual's self-assessment of their values, skills and goals, further describes and defines "worker" characteristics. This study demonstrates that the career anchor concept appears to be a tool which HRD professionals can use to guide individuals in learning more about themselves, and lead organizations to better utilize and understand their employee assets.

Career planning and development of the individual are key factors in HRD functions. The ability to integrate the individual's needs, values, talents and self-awareness into the requirements and structure of an organization is the work of the HRD professional in order to develop the maximum potential of the individual while seeing to the greatest functionality of the organization. The identification of an individual's occupational self-concept, the career anchor, is an effective career strategy that can facilitate enlightened career decision-making and planning for career development in keeping with the interests of the individual and the organization.

From an individual perspective, and in conjunction with HRD professionals and researchers, a career can not be managed effectively if an individual does not know his or her needs, biases, or motives (Schein, 1990). Individuals seeking employment must decide what type of career to pursue and the type of setting in which to work (Dilon and White, 1988). Each employee should perform a self-appraisal and evaluation of themselves in terms of their

perceptions about careers. This should contain a systematic approach to data collection and analysis so that the individual has a clear understanding of their needs with respect to their career (Hodgetts and Kroeck, 1992). The career anchor assessment tool can be a vital part of this process. This tool offers the individual the ability to identify what values, skills and abilities are most important to them. While not a panacea for career choice and all career decision, it offers a useful approach from which the individual can evaluate career choices in terms of core professional identity through the career anchor, and in so doing enhance organization and individual job harmony.

References

Applin, M. K. (1982). A study of the careers of management consultants. Unpublished master's thesis. Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge.

Barth, T. J. (1993). Career anchor theory. Review of Public Personnel Administration, 13(4), 27-42.

Burnstine, R. (1982). Career anchors of management and strategic consultants. Unpublished master's thesis. Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge.

Delong, T. J. (1982). The career orientations inventory: Assessing the career needs and values of educators. Brigham Young University, Provo. UT.

Dillon, R. D. & White, P. E. (1988, Spring). Finding the job that fits. Journal of Career Planning and Employment, 48, 61-64.

Hardin, J. R. (1995). The career orientation of CPAs: An empirical analysis. Unpublished dissertation, University of Mississippi.

Hodgetts, R. M. & Kroeck, K. G. (1992). Personal and Human Resource Management. Fort Worth, TX: The Dryden Press.

Holland, J. L. (1985). Making vocational choices (2nd ed.). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.

McMillan, J.H. and Schumacher, S. (1997). Research in education (4th ed.). White Plains, NY: Longman.

Parsons, F. (1909). Choosing a vocation. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Schein, E. H. (1975, September). The stability of values in the first ten years of the career. Office of Naval Research. Cambridge, MA: MIT.

Schein, E. H. (1978). Career dynamics: matching individual and organizational needs. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.

Schein, E. H. (1980). Career theory and research: Some issues for the future. In C. B. Derr (Ed.), Work, family, and the career (pp. 357-363). New York: Praeger.

Schein, E. H. (1982). Individuals and careers. (Report No. TR ONR 19). Arlington, VA: Office of Naval Research.

Schein, E. H. (1987). Individuals and careers. In J. W. Lorsch (Ed.). Handbook of organizational behavior (pp. 155-171). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.

Schein, E. H. (1990). Career anchors: Discovering your real values. San Diego: Pfeiffer.

Schein, E. H. (1996, November). Career anchors revisited: Implications for career development in the 21st century. The Academy of Management Executive, 10(4), 80-88.

Super, D. E. (1957). The psychology of careers. New York: Harper & Row.

Super, D. E. (1990). A life-span approach to career development. In D. Brown & L. Brooks (Eds.). Career Choice and Development (pp. 197-261). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Williamson, E. G. (1965). Vocational counseling. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Yankelovich, D. (1981). New rules: Searching for self-fulfillment in a world turned upside down. New York: Random House.

The views expressed in this article are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the official policy or position of the Department of the Navy, Department of Defense, nor the U.S. Government.

Women's Professional Organizations: Their Potential Role in Women's Careers

Sheila Barry-Oliver
Sharon J. Confessore.
The George Washington University

The purpose of this exploratory qualitative study was to investigate the potential role for women's professional organizations in women's career development and advancement. Sixteen women in leadership positions in diverse career fields, organizations, and career stages participated in the research. Five potential career benefits were described as occurring on the individual and interpersonal levels: self-esteem, skills, support, networking, and giving back. These benefits were obtained over the long-run from active participation in professional organizations.

Keywords: Woment's Professional Development, Professional Organizations

Women began to enter the U.S. workforce in significant numbers in the 1960s and 1970s. However, recent data tell us that women are not succeeding to the most senior levels in organizations to the same degree as men. Although women represent 46% of the U.S. workforce and 40% of all management and supervisory positions, they represent less than 5% of senior management. Extensive research has focused on the causes of this low representation and on potential solutions. Morrison and Von Glinow (1990) proposed that the differences resulted from gender differences, gender discrimination, or structural systemic discrimination.

If developmental opportunities for women within their work organizations are limited, then perhaps external activities should also be considered as possible avenues for developmental opportunities. Professional organizations are prevalent, and have been identified as possible sources of external visibility, competence acquisition, mentors and role models (Rusaw, 1995), which are associated with women's career advancement. Anecdotal information suggests that women's professional organizations provide unique developmental opportunities. In Adams' (1979) study of 60 professional women, the participants indicated that women's profession organizations enabled them to find others who live with the same pressure, to better evaluate where they were in their careers, to get emotional support, to balance the isolation of work, and to find mentors and sponsorship.

Professional organizations have been found to be a common factor in the career histories of women in management or leadership positions (Bruegman, 1995; Rusaw, 1989). To the extent that professional organizations are a reflection of the profession, gender issues present in the professional work context may also be present in professional organizations. Perhaps this is why more than 500 women's professional organizations have been established since 1980. The Business Women's Network Directory lists 900 professional women's organizations--either national or local--that individuals can join.

Statement of the Problem and Research Questions

The need for strategies to promote women into and through the ranks of management is well established. To date, the strategies that have been examined are internal to the work organizations. It has been generally assumed that professional organizations are beneficial to one's career and there is some evidence that career development can occur in external professional organizations (e.g., Bruegman, 1995; Rusaw, 1989). Though internal single gender organizations have been proposed as one remedy (Catalyst, 1991), external single gender organizations have not been specifically addressed in research addressing the career needs of women.

The purpose of this study was to investigate the potential role for women's professional organizations in women's careers and in their advancement--into and through the ranks of management. There are a significant number of women's professional organizations: some are membership organizations, some might be classified as learning communities, some are based on professional areas of expertise (e.g., information technology), some are based on functional role, etc. There have been very few studies of professional organizations and the research that has been conducted has been from the perspective of the organization and its role in staff development programs and in encouraging non-traditional careers for women. However, there has been no study of women's professional organizations and their career development contribution using the lens of women's career development theories as a base for study.

Copyright 1999 Barry-Oliver and Confessore

This study focused on professional women who achieved leadership positions in their careers and who have participated in women's professional organizations. The study sought to understand the benefits of participation and how participation contributed to their careers. Since women do not appear to be getting the development they need to progress into management, the question that is addressed is: What role can single gender mechanisms, such as women's professional organizations, play in women's career development and advancement? Specifically, what benefits accrue to women who participate in professional women's organizations that are of relevance to their careers and to their development and advancement?

This study is important because it investigates a previously unresearched strategy for contributing to women advancing into and through management. This study is an exploratory qualitative study designed to begin to understand a phenomenon not previously researched. This study assumes that career advancement means promotion, as to a higher rank or level, and/or progress or furtherance in one's career, as in additional responsibilities; career development means career growth, building up, becoming better (often career development is associated with skills building and gaining competence, either through training and education or specific assignments); and a professional organization is an entity whose goals are the furtherance of its members' profession(s) and the advancement of their professional interests (often termed "association" or "society").

Theoretical Framework

Career theory research has been identified as career development, career advancement, career paths, career success, career strategies, career achievement, career choices, career psychology, paths to power and upward mobility, to name a few. Of all these variations, career development seems to be the most general term for addressing the progress of one's career, with positional advancement, increased title, or additional responsibility as the measure of one's progress. Numerous studies have found differences in the careers of men and women (Adams, 1979; Larwood & Gattiker, 1987; Ohlott, Ruderman, & McCauley, 1994). Morrison, White and Van Velsor (1987) identified five organizational experiences and conditions associated with the demonstrated career progress of women: support and encouragement, training and development opportunities, feeling accepted, challenging and visible job assignments, and an absence of tension. Burke and McKeen (1995) examined the relationship between the work experiences identified by Morrison and the career success of managerial and professional women. They found that women who received more training and development, received more support and encouragement, felt more accepted, and were given more visible challenging work assignments were more satisfied, involved and successful in their careers.

Recent models of career development that have specifically focused on women's career development and advancement have taken a systems approach. The models contain multiple variables and address both person and situation explanations. These models of career development do not accept the traditional assumption that one's career is continuous and the authors incorporate non-work personal variables (e.g., marital status, parental status) as components necessary to understand women's careers. Research suggests that women interweave work and family in a way that men do not (Fitzgerald, Fassinger, & Betz, 1997) and have different views of occupational achievement and the balance of work and family. Certainly there is a proliferation of career development theories being applied to women today, with no consensus on the variables.

Ragins and Sundstrom (1989) focused on the career paths to power, which have implications for advancement. Morrison (1992), building on her earlier work, proposed a framework for career development that includes three elements: challenge, recognition and support. Tharenou and Conroy (1994) evaluated the relative importance of situation-centered variables and person-centered variables in women's advancement. Tharenou, Latimer and Conroy (1994) evaluated the relative importance of situational and individual influences in women's and men's managerial advancement and found that separate models for women and men were more explanatory--male hierarchy and home status contributed negatively to self-confidence, career encouragement, work experience, and training and development for women, while contributing positively for men.

Two areas frequently mentioned in women's career advancement are mentoring and self-confidence. Research has repeatedly shown the importance of mentors and sponsorship to career advancement. Mentors can often be role models, but for women this becomes problematic when there are no women in senior positions to be mentors. Role models are most effective when they are personally relevant to the observer. Likewise, cross-gender mentoring relationships have been found to create problems. The notion of one-on-one mentoring relationships was expanded to also include peer relationships (Kram & Isabella, 1985). Peer relationships were found to fulfill both career enhancing and psychosocial functions.

Self-confidence is mentioned often in connection with women's career development. When addressing the development of women managers, Burrow (1978) found that the principal development needs of women were self-

confident attitudes, education to expand general management skills, and the opportunities to develop management skills. Self-confident attitudes encompassed self-awareness, self-image, confidence, assertiveness and leadership. Burrow's survey found that women had more affiliation needs and less opportunity to satisfy them. The isolation of being a woman in a male-dominated environment often creates uncertainty over one's self-esteem. Bruegman (1995) found that the internal factors of self-confidence, values, and communication were the major influences affecting women's career advancement and that women continue to struggle with self-confidence. Self-esteem appears to be more strongly related to achievement motivation for females than males (Betz & Fitzgerald, 1987).

The dynamics in affinity groups are different from those in heterogeneous group settings. Homogeneous groups have been shown to have more cohesion, trust, satisfaction, security, and freedom. Cohesion is particularly fostered in homogeneous groups. Attitude similarity is positively reinforcing and evokes a positive affective response (liking). Homogeneous groups are assumed to have more attitude similarity, which increases the satisfaction and trust among the group members. Women's groups have been shown to enable intimacy among women, lessening the tendency toward competition. This kind of sisterhood enhanced bonding in the group and increased a sense of responsibility among members, which facilitated disclosure and honesty. Women have been shown to self-disclose more to women than to men.

A strong case has been made for providing single-gender environments for learning, i.e., a safe environment for women to discuss and address gender-related issues in the workplace. Single-gender leadership development programs have been shown to have unique benefits including: reducing isolation, building support groups and networks, and confirming that differences can be assets. Participants can experiment with new ideas, skills, and behaviors in a less threatening environment and build their individual strengths without having to represent all women.

Methodology

Research participants were drawn from a women's leadership organization that "recognizes, educates and connects accomplished and diverse women to increase their individual and collective impact globally." All program participants held leadership positions in their work organizations or their community and all have college degrees (43% have masters degrees and 22% have doctorates). The 16 research participants had considerable diversity in profession (4 in management, 4 entrepreneurs, 7 executives, and 1 attorney), organization type (8 in corporations, 4 in small businesses, 2 in education, 1 in nonprofit, and 1 in a partnership), organization size (4 in organizations with less than 10 employees, 2 in organizations with 250-500 employees, 6 in organizations with 1,000-10,000 employees, and 4 in organizations with 50,000 or more employees), female representation in management (8 in organizations with less than 15% and 8 in organizations with 15% or more), and age (1 in the 20-34 range, 8 in the 35-49 range, and 7 in the 50 and over range). Demographically, 63% are married and 37% are single or divorced; 64% have children and 36% have no children. Of the nine with children, two had a break in their career to spend time with their families. From a career perspective, 75% have been in the same career field continuously while 25% have changed career fields; in addition, 63% have had one or few employers while 37% have had several employers. Of the four research participants who are in small businesses, three participants spent part of their careers in corporations; thus 11 of the 16 research participants spent part of their careers in corporate work environments. The study participants come from multiple organizations (16) in different industries (13) with multiple functional disciplines (13). Professional organization participation also varied, ranging from 1 to 8 organizations and 1 to 28 years of participation in each. In summary, the research participants represent a broad range of experience and situations.

Three methods of data collection were used in this study: in-depth interviews, document review, and questionnaires. The screening questionnaire was sent to 115 individuals, with a 48% (n=55) response rate, of which 44 volunteered to be interviewed. Literature suggests that individuals work on different developmental tasks at different ages and career stages (Hudson, 1991; Levinson, 1996). Three career age groups were identified as the most likely to represent individuals in early (20-34), middle (35-49) and late (50+) career stages. The interviewees were initially selected based on career stage and demographic group. After the first several interviews, it became apparent that the interview was much richer if the interviewee had significant participation in multiple professional organizations. Therefore significant participation in multiple professional organizations became an additional selection criterion. Two of the three non-white participants canceled their interviews and the remaining non-white volunteers did not have significant professional organization participation; thus the final group of research participants did not have significant ethnic diversity.

Two interviews were conducted with each interviewee: the first served as the primary data collection interview and the second as a confirmatory interview. General exploratory questions based on existing literature in women's career theories were used for the first interview with three areas addressed: work environment, career progression and professional organization participation. Prior to scheduling the second interview, a copy of the transcript from the first interview and a listing of preliminary findings were sent to each participant. The second interview was used to confirm the researcher's interpretation of the first interview as well as provide the interviewee with an opportunity to elaborate on her original statements. The preliminary findings were reviewed with each interviewee for the purpose of identifying relevant areas that may not have surfaced in the first interview. The in-depth semi-structured interviews lasted 1.5 to 2 hours in total for each interviewee for both interviews.

The second data source was information from or about professional organizations. A total of 68 professional organizations were contacted: 35 mixed gender and 33 women's. Of these, 32 professional organizations (21 mixed gender and 11 women's) responded. Additional information was obtained from professional organization directories and Internet web sites. The organizations that were not professional organizations were excluded from the analysis. A final set of 46 professional organizations (27 mixed gender and 19 women's) were included in the analysis. The third data source was information on the screening questionnaires: reasons for participation in the leadership development program, benefits of participation, and how the participant's experience differed from expectations. In addition, the respondents identified the mixed gender and women's professional organizations in which they participated and the extent of their participation.

The transcribed interviews, the professional organization documents and the data from the questionnaires were content analyzed for common career development topics. These topics were then grouped by category and organized around themes to understand the role for women's professional organizations. The organizing of the data was done on an iterative basis with the data providing the organizing system. The research participants indicated overwhelming agreement with the collective comments and attested to their reasonableness. The preliminary findings were also reviewed with several independent researchers to confirm the credibility of the results.

Results

There were strong overlaps between the career benefits identified by the research participants and the professional organizations themselves, but also some clear differences. Both the professional organizations and the research participants identified networking and knowledge as the key benefits of participation. Annual meetings sponsored by the professional organizations provide the opportunity for both of these benefits. Knowledge, as described by the professional organizations, also included publications, newsletters, information networks, workshops/seminars/conferences, subscriptions, and exchanging ideas. The mixed gender professional organizations also identified legislative advocacy as a key benefit, though this was barely mentioned by the research participants and mentioned only by a limited number of women's professional organizations. Accreditation and certification was mentioned only by mixed gender professional organizations. One-third of the professional organizations mentioned financial programs, such as discounts, insurance, and credit cards, though these programs were not mentioned by any research participants. A small number of the professional organizations mentioned benefits such as scholarships, leadership opportunities, recognition, research foundations, and direct career assistance as benefits. The benefits portrayed by the professional organizations did not differ significantly between the mixed gender and the women's professional organizations.

Career Benefits of Participation

The key career benefits obtained from participation in professional organizations can be described as occurring on the individual, interpersonal, and organizational levels (see Figure 1). These benefits were obtained over the duration of their participation.

Figure 1. Career Benefits from Participation in Professional Organizations.

Individual level	Interpersonal level	Organizational level
• Self-esteem	• Support	• Business development
• Skills	• Networking	
• Knowledge	• Giving back	

Research participants reported some career benefit being gained from participation in both mixed gender and women's professional organizations, but five benefits appeared to have unique dimensions when acquired from participation in women's professional organizations: self-esteem, skills, support, networking, and giving back. These five are discussed below.

Self-esteem

Self-esteem had several dimensions: motivation, inspiration, self-confidence, self-promotion, and recognition. The motivation and inspiration came from both the content of the programs and the interaction with other members. The programs often addressed topics that the women did not have occasion to think about in their daily workplace. Exposure to such topics was seen as motivating and inspiring. Likewise, interaction with the other participants was inspiring. The motivation and inspiration had a beneficial impact on their career aspirations. For example, "It brought home to me the fact that I have limitless potential."

The professional organizations enabled the women to gain self-confidence, through leadership positions and through positive interactions with other professionals, particularly in the women's professional organizations. This self-confidence was translated back to the workplace in several ways. Sometimes it resulted in direct action, which resulted in more visibility and recognition in the workplace. Sometimes it resulted in more self-confidence at work.

The professional organizations provided an environment for promoting oneself, as a business person and as an individual. For those from corporate environments, it was an environment free of politics and power; for those in business for themselves, it was an environment independent of business development and delivery. The emphasis was on individual, not business, development. In some cases the professional organization promoted its members as candidates for new opportunities in work organizations, which provided additional emphasis to the candidacy. Participation provided recognition. For some women, participation provided the opportunity to be visible and to receive recognition that was not available within their work organization. The professional organizations provided the opportunity to have their skills publicly recognized. For some women, recognition translated into enhanced stature and opportunities at their work organization. Leadership positions in the professional organizations conveyed importance to the woman in that position.

Participation in the professional organizations also provided a balance to the isolation the women felt at work. The women described participation in the women's professional organizations as enabling them to interact as whole persons, not just business persons, and as enabling them to better cope with the pressures they encounter as women in the workplace. As a result, the research participants reported being better able to deal with the pressures of work, to be more engaged in their workplace, and to tackle the obstacles they faced at work, all of which contributed to their ability to advance in their workplace.

Skills

The skills most often identified were leadership skills and communication skills. Participation in leadership positions enabled the participants to develop the management skills of planning, budgeting, organizing, staffing, delegating, and controlling and the leadership skills of setting a direction, motivating, and inspiring. Communication skills included both formal presentations and informal interaction, as well as written communication.

When these opportunities happened early in careers, they were described as learning experiences. When these opportunities happened later in careers, they were described as refining and enhancing skills. Often the opportunities for leadership in the professional organizations came before such opportunities in the work organization. Thus it was an opportunity to develop skills before they were needed at work and to be better positioned for new opportunities. The research participants believed that the professional organizations provided an opportunity to develop skills in a penalty-free environment; a mistake did not damage one's career--a mistake could be a learning experience. When the women discussed the learning environment in the women's professional organizations, it was from the perspective of the other members encouraging them to take on new challenges and asking them to do something--a supportive learning environment. The professional organizations provided some of the same opportunities to learn that developmental assignments in the work organization might have provided, without the potential downside.

Support

Support was described by the research participants as emotional support, encouragement, nurturance and friendships. The women often found themselves isolated at work with few other women in their work organizations, particularly those who entered the workforce in the 1960s, and many of the women described their work environments as male-dominated. Participation in the women's professional organizations provided some balance to the isolation, which enabled the women to better confront the isolation and gender bias they encountered in their workplace. Lessons learned about how to handle work situations (particularly interpersonal or token situations) were shared, which again enabled the women to better handle the situations they were confronting.

Professional organizations could be an anchor during times of transition, could facilitate relocations, and enabled the women who had a break in their career to maintain professional contacts and to remain functionally current with their profession. Professional organizations were viewed by the research participants as a safer environment than the work organization, safer for learning and safer for seeking guidance and support. There were no penalties to expressing a lack of knowledge or for self-disclosure. There was a sense that the research participants self-disclosed more in the women's professional organizations and that the level of trust was higher there than in mixed gender professional organizations or in the workplace. Thus the support could be more meaningful to the individual.

Networking

Interacting with others, making personal and professional contacts, finding mentors or sponsors, and developing relationships were all part of what was described as networking. Networks in the context of the professional organizations had the same characteristics as networks in the context of the work organizations, that is, both formal and informal networks and both instrumental and expressive networks existed.

The expressive networks provide personal relationships. Particularly for those in male-dominated workplaces, these networks filled a gap in their work networks. Instrumental networks involve the exchange of work-related information, expertise, advice and potential access to resources. Some women viewed the professional organization networks as an extension of networks they had already developed in their work organizations. Sometimes the women found mentors (both male and female) through the professional organizations. The cross-sex mentoring relationships did not suffer from the same potential pitfalls as those found in work organizations, for example, resentful co-workers. Some women were able to have same-sex mentoring relationships, when this was not feasible in their workplace given the limited numbers of women in senior positions.

The contacts the women made opened new doors for them. Overwhelmingly the research participants described networking as the major benefit of participation in professional organizations--both instrumental and expressive. As one woman said, "By far the collegial relationships are the biggest benefit."

Giving back

For the research participants in their later career stage, giving back to others in their profession was a key benefit identified by them. This was specifically discussed in the context of helping younger women in their careers, but was also clearly an element of their own development as adults. Giving back occurred through mentoring and guiding others. Even when the women believed that they were no longer obtaining the same degree of benefit from a professional organization, they felt an obligation to continue to participate so that other women might benefit in the same way that they had when they were in earlier career stages.

These women also felt an obligation to mentor younger women in their work organizations, but were concerned about the dearth of senior women in their work organizations and the time constraints imposed upon them by mentoring others with no direct recognition or career benefit to them. Even though the women expressed concerns, they also indicated that they mentored younger women whenever possible. The research participants felt personal fulfillment and were able to help the careers of younger women. There was a sense of a "community of women," conceptually if not in reality, that was important to care for--that women needed to reach out to one another.

Overall Perspective

There were three overarching observations about participation in professional organizations. First, the benefits obtained from participation in both mixed gender and women's professional organizations were obtained over the long run, though some could be obtained faster in the women's professional organizations. Second, there was a strong belief among the research participants that "gender issues are alive and well"--in the workplace and in society--and thus there is a real need for women's professional organizations. The research participants believed that it was important to share lessons learned and to help younger women understand these issues. Third, mixed gender professional organizations were important too because women work with men. "We don't live in a vacuum, we don't operate or work in vacuums, and we need to interact with both sides." According to the research participants, participation in both mixed gender and women's professional organizations provided the best path for contributing to one's career development and advancement. However, there were some differences in the career benefits described by the research participants between women's and mixed gender professional organizations.

Perceived Advantage of Women's Professional Organizations

Although the research participants saw career benefits from participation in both mixed gender and women's professional organizations, they believed there were differences in the benefits obtained. These differences resulted primarily from their experiences that women interacted as whole persons whereas men interacted only on a business level. As one woman said, "The women's groups tend to take a more holistic approach." Thus both the content and the context of the interactions were different.

The women shared stories with one another about how they coped with different situations (e.g., balancing work and family, dealing with difficult interpersonal work situations, handling being a token). There were more conversations about family issues and the women got to an intimate (i.e., more personal) level more quickly in the women's professional organizations, which they did not do in mixed gender professional organizations. The women found it easier to connect and to identify with the women than in the mixed gender setting.

The general perception was that women started from a position of trust in the women's professional organizations, which was not true in the mixed gender professional organizations. The interactions were described as "more relational" in the women's professional organizations, and the women were perceived to be more supportive. For example, "Women were more willing to help you when you're down and to cheer you when you're up." This was in contrast to the women "measuring their words a little more carefully" in mixed gender professional organizations.

The research participants also viewed the level of participation to be different. Typically the women viewed their participation as greater in the women's professional organizations due to their greater comfort level with women, as well as to other female members reaching out. The camaraderie and openness described in the women's professional organizations contributed to this greater comfort level. This contrasted with the mixed gender professional organizations where the women tended "to sit back and watch to get a feel for the flow before jumping in." The perception was that you had to promote yourself to take advantage of opportunities in the mixed gender professional organizations whereas others reached out to you and encouraged in the women's professional organizations.

The result of the differences between women's and mixed gender professional organizations was that the women moved more quickly into active participation and leadership positions in the women's professional organizations than in the mixed gender professional organizations, which enabled leadership and communication skills and self-esteem to be developed more quickly in the women's professional organizations. Emotional support and encouragement were described as present in the women's professional organizations, but not in the mixed gender professional organizations. The expressive networks and the female mentors described by the research participants were found in the women's professional organizations, but not in the mixed gender professional organizations. And giving back to others was manifested only in the women's professional organizations.

There were some potential negative differences between mixed gender and women's professional organizations. Some expressed concern that the women's professional organizations were more cliquish and that women could be more critical of each other. Because the women's professional organizations were often established to address a perceived problem, there was a belief among some that these groups required a constant emotional reconfirmation of one's commitment to their ideals, which could be emotionally draining.

Conclusions

The purpose of this study was to investigate the potential value of women's professional organizations for women's careers. This study results indicate that there is a potential role for women's professional organizations, but that role will vary depending on the needs of the individual. There were seven potential career benefits for women from participation in professional organizations, of which five were gained predominantly from participation in women's professional organizations: self-esteem, skills, support, networking, and giving back. Although the women clearly saw benefit to participation and they were able to identify transference of those benefits from the professional organizations to their workplace, they were unable to make the connection between those benefits and their career development and advancement.

The benefits to be obtained from participating in professional organizations were seen as complementary to experiences in the work organization. Sometimes participation was able to fill in the career development gaps found in the workplace. Participating in professional organizations is not equivalent with belonging to professional organizations, that is, one must actively participate and take on leadership roles to gain the full benefit of participation.

This study was a preliminary exploratory study with a limited number of study participants who were all American professional women in leadership positions. The data collected was retrospective and thus potentially limited by the interviewees' recollections and by their ability to objectively evaluate the factors contributing to their own career development and advancement. This study explicitly restricted itself to the study of the role of women's professional organizations in women's careers and its findings may not generalize to other external professional activities nor to other single gender organizations. This study was limited to the experiences of the participants and the organizations to which they belong. There appear to be differences in the career benefits across career stage and among participants from different work environment, but these indications warrant further study. This study focused on women and did not ask whether benefits could be obtained by men participating in professional organizations or whether the benefits obtained by women differed from the benefits obtained by men.

Contribution to New Knowledge in HRD

The three primary audiences for the results of this study are work organizations, women in the workforce, and women's professional organizations. First, with women representing nearly 50% of the entrants into the workforce, work organizations are interested in how best to develop and maximize this large resource, resulting in development and advancement for women. This study asked whether benefits might accrue to a woman's career from participation in a women's professional organization and when this avenue of career development might be beneficial for a work organization to support. Second, with evidence of less than a level playing field (i.e., the presence of the glass ceiling), women are interested in how best to improve their chances for advancing in work organizations. It appears that women's professional organizations may be a vehicle to enhance career development and advancement. Finally, with professional organizations vying for members, women's professional organizations would be interested in studies that articulated the benefits to potential (and current) members of belonging to their type of organization. This study contributes to the body of knowledge in HRD through the investigation of the role and purposes of women's professional organizations for women's careers.

References

Adams, J. (1979). *Women on Top: Success Patterns and Personal Growth*. New York: Hawthorne Books.

Betz, N. E., & Fitzgerald, L. F. (1987). Personality variables and women's career development: self-concept and sex role-related characteristics. In N. E. Betz (Ed.), *The Career Psychology of Women* (pp. 112-128). New York: Academic Press.

Bruegman, S. A. (1995). *Women Chief Executive Officers In California Higher Education: Influence Of Mentoring And Other Factors On Career Advancement (Administrators)*. , University Of California, Davis.

Burke, R. J., & McKeen, C., A. (1995). Work experiences, career development and career success of managerial and professional women. *Journal of Social Behavior & Personality, 10*(6), 81-96.

Burrow, M. G. (1978). *Developing women managers: what needs to be done* (Survey Report). New York: AMA.

Catalyst. (1991). *Women in Corporate Management: Model Programs for Development and Mobility*. New York.

Fitzgerald, L. F., Fassinger, R. E., & Betz, N. E. (1997). Theoretical advances in the study of women's career development. In W. B. W. S. H. Osiprow (Ed.), *Handbook of Vocational Psychology* (pp. 67-109). Hillsdale, N.J.: Erlbaum.

Hudson, F. M. (1991). *The Adult Years*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Kram, K. E., & Isabella, L. A. (1985). Mentoring alternatives: the role of peer relationships in career development. *Academy of Management Journal, 28*(1), 110-132.

Larwood, L., & Gattiker, U. E. (1987). A comparison of the career paths used by successful women and men. In B. Gutek & L. Larwood (Eds.), *Women's career development* (pp. 129-156). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Levinson, D. J. (1996). *The Season's of a Woman's Life*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf.

Morrison, A. M. (1992). *The New Leaders*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Morrison, A. M., & Von Glinow, M. A. (1990). Women and minorities in management. *American Psychologist, 45*(2), 200-208.

Morrison, A. M., White, R. P., & Van Velsor, E. (1987). *Breaking the Glass Ceiling*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.

Ohlott, P. J., Ruderman, M. N., & McCauley, C. D. (1994). Gender differences in managers' developmental job experiences. *Academy of Management Journal, 37*(1), 46-67.

Ragins, B. R., & Sundstrom, E. (1989). Gender and power in organizations: a longitudinal perspective. *Psychological Bulletin, 105*, 51-88.

Rusaw, A. C. (1989). *The role of training and development in the career histories of women managers in the federal government*. Unpublished Ph.D., Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg, VA.

Rusaw, A. C. (1995). Learning by association: professional associations as learning agents. *Human Resource Development Quarterly, 6*(2), 215-226.

Tharenou, P., & Conroy, D. K. (1994). Men and women managers advancement. *Applied Psychology: An International Review, 43*, 5-31.

Tharenou, P., Latimer, S., & Conroy, D. (1994). How do you make it to the top? An examination of influences on women's and men's managerial advancement. *Academy of Management Journal, 37*(4), 899-931.

Non-profits and Women CEOs' Careers

Jenny Harrow
Veronica Mole
South Bank University, London, UK.

This paper explores questions of the development of a 'new balance' between the self-interests of women chief executives in British non-profits and the organisational interests of non-profits in retaining able women. Two contrasting theoretical frameworks are used. That of 'career development', emphasising the primacy of the individual; and that of 'capacity building', in which organisational needs predominate. Implications for human resource development in smaller non profits are identified.

Keywords: Women, CEOs, Non-Profits

There are currently tensions within the non-profit sector in Britain between individual and organisational aspirations for career development for women and the needs of non-profit organisations, (especially smaller organisations), for long term worker commitment. Women senior managers predominate among the smaller organisations, where organisational survival may depend upon the retention of these key women postholders. Their individual careers, (if regarded as an organisationally upward trajectory) may be on hold, neglected or abandoned. Smaller organisations have difficulties in planning strategically for human resource development and change. Yet many are under pressure to convince funders that they will not collapse if key workers (often women) leave. The sector appears increasingly driven by asking 'what do funders want?', and in this case, "what do they want in terms of our HR policy and practice?" However this is circumscribed by what women CEOs want themselves and what they have been able to achieve.

This paper draws on three studies: two completed and one ongoing, to illustrate this issue. The first shows women CEOs in Britain as over-represented in the smaller organisations. The second highlights the organisational survival tactics of smaller voluntary organisations, faced with a range of demanding funding regimes, and involving heavy reliance on one woman CEO staying with the organisation through thick and thin. The third, on which the paper concentrates, moves away from context to take cognisance of the people at the centre of the issue. It examines women's CEOs perceptions and experiences of their career development and transitions, through an ongoing series of in-depth interviews, using biographical research methods. Drawing on the prior research, this biographically-based study asks whether women CEOs in this sector are remaining organisation-centred (by choice or by necessity as career options are limited) or are becoming self-orientated in terms of career development?

Some early implications for human resource development in this sector, arising from this question of relative balance of interest, are discussed. These include the extent to which this sector "wants things both ways" - to be seen to be developing career-friendly environments for women, where their all round ability can be demonstrated (in one respondent's terms,"doing what it takes"); but also making heavy demands on women's commitment when the organisation is struggling and known to be surviving against the odds (from another respondent's perception, when the organisation is to all intents and purposes, "running on empty").

The Theoretical Framework - 'Career Development' and 'Capacity Building'

With the research focus that of the individual career perceptions and experiences of *existing* women CEOs in non-profits, the literature from career theorists is central. Thus, Evetts (1992) examines the prescriptive notion of rationally planned careers as 'upwards moves', where deviation from this norm is seen as imperfect. For women, careers might be 'interrupted'; for both men and women, their careers might be 'blocked' or 'opted-out of' or 'time-serving' (Evetts 1994). Men's and women's career success tends to be assessed in terms of movements up through organisational ladders. Yet, many women and indeed many men appear to want things other than 'advancement' from organisational career structures. This is especially pertinent to careers in non-profits where the size of organisation and the insecurity of tenure may preclude advancement through an organisational hierarchy, and where well structured internal career paths scarcely exist, apart from within the very largest organisations. For many CEOs

Copyright ©1999 Jenny Harrow and Veronica Mole

in non-profits therefore career success may be seen more in terms of 'making a difference' than career advancement as an end in itself.

Career development is seen by Arthur et al (1989) as influenced both by the individual and external institutions. Inkson (1995) points to the themes of "..order., progression and proactivity" as underpinning much academic theory on career development. In reviewing the effects of changing economic conditions on managerial job changes, Inkson argues that a "better approach" (for organisations) might be to "encourage organisational newcomers to be realistic about the endemic and increasing uncertainty of future occupational progress" (1995, 1993). Hirsch et. al. (1995) argue that organisations are relying more on 'self development' on the part of employees because the pace of change makes it ever more difficult to provide well-structured career paths and development. The increasing emphasis on self-development is a major culture change, implying as it does that everyone can develop and progress. In this context personal development plans, mentors, and networking are all indicative of a self-development approach to careers.

This literature has provided an overall thinking and language framework for the women CEOs' career perceptions study although it draws mainly on employment worlds other than those of non-profits. The challenges for the research include the extent to which the changing environment of non-profits contrasts with that of the for-profit world, inasmuch as the needs for human service work during periods of recession may be expanding rather than contracting. Thus, more traditional notions of 'career' may still be legitimate in this sector. Since the women CEOs study began, an organisational explanation of "what's going on" has been articulated by Adamson, Doherty and Viney (1998): "..what we mean when we talk of the *death* of the career is simply that the rules of the career game have changed". How, if at all, this applies in the non-profits sector, is under exploration.

What of the organisational interest in this area? The concept of 'capacity building' has made the transition from the fields of economic and technical development to those of social and organisational development (Harrow, 1998). In the international and national NGO fields, funders seek to promote non-profits' organisational "capacities", with the assumption that with improved capacity comes improved and sustainable performance. The development of human resources of these organisations is seen as a core component. Ohiohenuan and Wunker (1995) concentrate on the understanding of organisations' internal capacity through examination of four key areas - those of human resources, organisational processes, physical resources and external support.

Hilderbrand and Grindle define "capacity" as "the ability to perform appropriate tasks effectively, efficiently and sustainably"(1997, 34). Their five-fold framework for assessing 'dimensions of capacity', to aid capacity-building interventions, includes (as the final 'dimension'), that of "human resources". Here the emphasis is on the retention and utilisation of individuals in organisations; and importantly for this paper, "the extent to which training and *career trajectories (our italics)* affect the overall performance of a given task". Hilderbrand and Grindle go on to argue for the inter-connectedness of organisational performance and human resources. In case study research, they discovered the relative importance of "effective utililisation" of human resources as a contributing factor in organisational performance, rather than the 'recruitment' or 'training' aspects of human resource management,. (op. cit., 53). They found "professionals very sensitive to whether their jobs were meaningful"; with "retention highly sensitive to performance rewards and job satisfaction". Although this model is public sector-oriented, its application to non-profits is signalled strongly. Public funding for this sector is extensive; and the feature of 'resource constraints', which affect public services, manifestly are also a feature of non-profit organisational life.

These areas of the literature provide the underpinnings for the accounts of the research which follow. Intriguingly, the HR component in the 'capacity building' literature appears to imply a strong coincidence of organisational and individual interest in career development processes; whilst some of that in the individualistic field of career development (especially the self-development work) does not. In this sense, the over-arching research question in this paper, whether women CEOs see themselves as moving towards individualised or organisationally-rooted career perspectives, or in maintaining these pressures in some sort of balance, appears particularly important.

Prior Research (I) The UK ACENVO survey

A survey investigating the relationship between gender, CEO position and size of voluntary organisation was carried out by the Association of Chief Executives of National Voluntary Organisations and the Centre for Public Services Management, during 1994/95 (Dawson, 1998). The survey was sent to all 540 ACENVO members, with a response rate of 59% (321). By chance, the profile of the respondents closely reflected the then gender split of the ACENVO membership: 60% men and 40% women. Again by chance, the organisations in the sample reflected the range of organisations in ACENVO, in relation to total income.

A direct relationship between the size of the voluntary organisation and the gender of the CEO was found. Male CEOs were found in 75% of the larger voluntary organisations, defined as possessing incomes of £5 million and over. Nearly 80% of the smaller voluntary organisations, with incomes of less than £100,000 had female CEOs. Just over 50% of organisations with incomes between £100,000 and £1 million and fewer than 20 full-time equivalent staff have female CEOs. The proportion of female CEOs declined to 30% in organisations with an income between £1-5 million, to 25% in organisations with an income between £5 -15 million, and to 20% in organisations with an income over £15 million.

Thus of the CEO posts held, women were more likely to head smaller organisations, with budgets of less than one million pounds, and fewer than 20 full-time equivalent staff. Where the staff were more than 80% female, then a woman was likely to be CEO. No relationship was found between gender and type of organisation, although 'umbrella' organisations were more likely to be run by women, with men CEOs predominating in international organisations. Whilst men and women CEOs in this sector headed every kind of organisation, and had similar qualifications and similar work patterns, a key difference was their location. Here, one explanation could relate to age groupings. There were similar numbers of men and women in the 40-49 age group. In larger organisations CEOs were likely to be over 50, and there were more male CEOs than women in the 50-59 and over-age groups. As quantitatively oriented research, this study did not address CEOs perceptions, (men's or women's) of their organisational location vis a vis their career, their organisations' relative prestige and power, nor the extent to which they were developing personal career plans, in which their organisation might, or might not, figure. Given the imbalance of men and women in location terms, a subsequent qualitatively-oriented study was indicated.

Prior Research (II) London and Sheffield (UK) Study on Funding Regimes and Capacity Building.

Concurrent research in the Centre for Public Services Management, funded by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation, during 1997/98 studied selected small voluntary organisations' responses to a variety of funding regimes (for example, survival, collapse, sustained or patchy growth); including an exploration and assessment of these organisations' capacity building abilities or strategies. Although the study did not set out to focus on the pivotal role of CEOs, it used the Ohionenuan and Wunker (1995) model of the constituent elements of 'capacity building', including that of human resources. From case studies of sixteen organisations, tracking back over ten years of their organisational histories, findings linked organisational viability to factors including organisations' networking skills and ability to manage (or good fortune with) their share of human resources. Among the latter, both an organisational strength and potential weakness was the heavy reliance on the senior manager or CEO. "Even in thriving organisations, skills deficits were acknowledged and were often compensated for by the abilities, energy and in some cases near superhuman performance of the chief worker". Predominantly, these postholders were women. For both men and women CEOs, organisational 'over reliance' on them was increased where funders failed or declined to fund 'deputies', and where the project-driven funding environment appeared to exclude many opportunities for developing the 'general management' human resource potential among other existing staff of the organisation.

The study was commissioned to help identify good practice for funders; and was not gender-directed. Its findings pointed to organisations' (and funders') responsibilities to recognise risks of 'over dependency', and develop succession planning strategies for these key posts, however limited. Succession planning had been seen throughout 15 of the 16 organisations as a luxury which ruefully they were unable to indulge in, rather than a necessity which their small size and scale made the more vital. The extent to which organisations in the study were going so far as to exploit their CEOs willingness to stay and work creatively, often on the brink of organisational demise, was recognised implicitly by the researchers; but not developed as a major research theme. Hence the case was strengthened further for a CEOs "perceptions" study, in which their, rather than the organisational 'stories' could be told.

Research in Progress: Women CEOs' perceptions of careers in the non profits

Primarily as the qualitative 'next stage' of the ACENVO/CPSM survey, a study entitled *'Voluntary Sector Chief Executives: Careers, gender and organisation, 1998 -2000'* began in CPSM in January 1998. This research investigates careers in the voluntary sector by undertaking career history/ researched biography interviews with a cohort of 25 women and 25 men chief executives of medium-sized organisations. The purpose of the research is to establish career histories of men and women CEOs in the non-profits sector showing how careers are made, and

pathways to the top of the organisation, drawing on the actors' "voices" as the information source. The choice of medium-sized organisations will eventually allow equal numbers of female and male participants to comprise the study sample, enabling comparisons to be made of women's and men's careers in this sector. Lengths of time in post will vary. The study sample is being obtained from organisations listed in the The Voluntary Agencies Directory 1997/1998.

Research Design Issues

The research design is exploratory and qualitatively oriented (Patton 1980, Marshall & Rossman 1989). The research question concerns whether CEOs' career 'patterns' or stories in this sector show them as either (a) remaining organisation- centred or (b) becoming self-orientated in terms of career development? Face to face interviewing with chief executives is being undertaken, using the approach of 'researched biographies/career histories' as advocated by Torbert and Fisher (1992), who argue that autobiographical writing is an indispensable process in social science research; and acts as a catalyst for managerial and organisational development. In this way the researchers hope that the 'giving' relationship implied by respondents' participation in research activity can be in a two-way form, with interviewing sessions providing a limited basis for self-reflection and learning by those respondents. The research approach which encourages the use of 'narrative research' as a means of drawing out meaning from respondents' language (Lieblich, Tuval Mashiach and Zilber, 1998) has also been drawn upon. Career histories gather data on individuals from their own perspective. The interviews are guided by four broad topic headings: the job and organisation, career history, working in the non-profit sector and future career aims and objectives. The research question is not posed directly.

Thus far, research among women respondents has been undertaken, with 15 interviews with CEOs analysed for thematic patterns which confirm findings for an overwhelmingly '(b)' position, as described in the research question. In particular, career history and future career aims and objectives sections of the data have been analysed in order to identify the career strategies of this sample of women CEOs. As the study progresses an appropriate software package (NUD.IST) will be used to aid data analysis.

A number of methodological problems are encountered using the career history method. Firstly, there is the problem of retrospective recall of information by participants in the study. Memories are fallible. However, since changes of job are significant events, the accuracy of the data collected is likely to be reasonable. There is also a tendency to ascribe some sort of pattern to a career looked at with hindsight. The issue of selective recall lends support to the argument that career history research is inevitably subjective. Notwithstanding, Dex (1991) in her review of research work on recall suggests that it can be reliable for certain topics, thus the claim that career histories are purely subjective goes too far. For this study we were concerned with matching the scientific reliability of survey research with the rich ethnographic data provided by career histories. In this way we gain a more detailed picture of careers in the voluntary sector.

The Research Sample

The women chief executives taking part in the career history interviews are working in a variety of non-profit organisations including professional associations (3), social services and healthcare (3), research, education and training charities (5), an intermediary organisation, housing advice, community development and law/advocacy organisation, respectively. The size of the organisations spans an income range between £80,000k and £2.5 million. The smallest organisation employs 2 staff members and the largest employs 30 staff members. Lengths of time in post vary from 8 months to 21 years. The women have a variety of functional backgrounds and experiences inside and outside the not for profit sector. Two women are aged between 25-34, three are between 35-44, eight are between 45-54 and two women are 55 and over. Eight of the fifteen women have two or more children.

The Research Findings

Findings from the career history interviews to date show women CEOs pursuing careers more predominantly within a context of 'self' than an organisational orientation.

> "... I would say that I have not been encouraged, at the same time people have not been unhelpful, but you have to do it yourself." (CEO, professional association)

Eight of the women interviewed described an overt career strategy of moving around within small and medium sized organisations, to gain experience, moves variously prompted by boredom or in one case by an external, temporary (male) 'mentor:

> "The person from Charity Appointments (an executive search agency) said I should apply. He said it would be a challenge and that I should have a go." (CEO, community development organisation)

Five of the women CEOs looked for new challenges by growing the organisation from within, especially findings new ways for the organisation to adapt to environmental change. This however prompted organisational dissatisfaction also; most marked by the respondent who reported awareness of organisation (or individual) exploitation:

> "There is no guaranteed income so that if the funding runs out we will lose our jobs. This makes for anger and frustration because we know that there are statutory organisations that should be funding us and they can get away with it because in the end ... people are taken advantage of because of their need to ensure that the organisation is there, so if we apply for funding and are defeated we will keep going. And I feel angry about that. ..." (manager: social services organisation.)

Two of the women interviewed may be described as occupying a space somewhere between organisation- self-orientation. Mindful of developing themselves and their careers they are also committed to growing the organisation. Thus

> "Work is very important to me and I want to do well but I am quite interested in growing this organization. I do not really want to run a big service provider, I'm more interested in research /policy-led organisations and that is what I want to do here." (CEO, community development)

Thus far in the interviews, a career in non-profits has been chosen by the women chiefly because it provides opportunities for meaningful work and the ability to 'make a difference' to the world in a socially-useful way. One respondent saw her needs and the organisation's needs as matched rather than in tension, whilst drawing apparently on what she saw as gender-specific qualities:

> "..I have always seen myself as a person who is good with people and in the voluntary sector this is an area that is very important, not only with service-users but also in terms of campaigning e.g. have to use charm, talk with judges and so on. This makes me feel good...." (manager, social service)

However, the question about their over-representation in the smaller organisations remains; with respondents somewhat apologetic rather than irritated or annoyed:. Thus

> "I would not have credibility applying for a bigger organisation because prospective employers will see that I'm leading a small organisation..."(CEO, professional association)

> "A lot of the support work, mentoring, trouble-shooting does not show on the CV and I wonder how credible that makes me for jobs in organisations employing 50 people but I have been doing the same in terms of managing and keeping all the plates spinning. A lot of the work is enabling others to do things and that is not so easy if you're trying to shift into the mainstream"(CEO, intermediary organisation).

To return to the overarching research question, are women becoming more career oriented or remaining organisationally focussed? Whilst strong claims for a new generation of women CEOs more committed towards self-oriented careers cannot be made using such a small sample alone, findings from the career history interviews show that over half of the women interviewed are developing this career strategy. Factors pushing this development may include the very existence of (relatively new) specialist executive search agencies; the normalisation of mentoring /networking (for example, six women were actively involved in action learning sets run by ACENVO) and eleven mentioned the importance of positive (and negative) role models, and supportive relationships. The career history interviews suggest so far that an individualist mood prevails. As the study progresses, more evidence to support

or refute this claim will be collected. However, women's representation in the larger organisations and movement between smaller organisations and larger organisations appears to remain a barrier to overcome.

Conclusions

Preliminary analyses of the women CEOs' perceptions of career development in this sector are suggesting a shift towards the 'me' and away from the 'us' view of work in the UK non-profits that seems to have prevailed in the organisational versions of their 'stories' of survival and growth. This confirms the view from the literature that "the rules of the career game" are changing for this group; whilst challenging the view that individual 'self development' is equally valuable for the host organisation. Such a development is in contrast to the London and Sheffield case studies, where women were reporting strong awareness of how much their organisation relied on them; and their apparent decision to continue commitment at a high level. The positive linkages between individual feelings of their value to their organisation and the quality of that organisation's performance (the 'capacity building' dimensions model) appears to be supported from the interviews to date. However, the research design itself may encourage this; and a case for developing some 'objective' measures of organisational success, alongside the 'stories' can be made.

A number of the women's accounts are beginning to suggest a picture of a 'caring sector' that does not actually 'care 'for its own people, in the sense of recognising and supporting career aspirations. In the smaller organisations, where there is heavy reliance on key postholders, this may be equated less with a full scale 'exploitation of women' situation; and more with a less clear cut exploitation of 'the feminine'. Thus, women's believed nurturing roles, and close commitments to colleagues are drawn upon to 'hang on' to key workers and to draw very high levels of performance from them. These kinds of experiences from the interviews, parallel strongly the accounts gained from the earlier case study work. Exercising a guilt-based hold on would be career- movers has appeared - the 'what would we do without you?' syndrome. At the same time, a handful of women CEOs may also be exploiting the 'feminine' in their plans to advance or at least sustain their careers.

As research in progress, this work is a long way from contributing to new career theory or at least to its adaptation, to take account of the particular employment world which the non-profits encompass. However, the chosen theoretical frameworks have already pointed to the potential for mismatch between the assumptions of organisational capacity building (where HR improvements leads to gains all round) and those of the career self-development literature, where organisational needs are necessarily set aside. What has been appearing as a running theme throughout the interviews, where interviewees have opted for the self- rather than organisational orientation in their career ideas, is the possibility that their organisations have yet to 'wake up' to this situation.

In other employment sectors, where traditional career routes are known to have ceased and diminished, both parties tend to possess this knowledge and act accordingly. Thus far, in this research, the non profits sector appears one where that sense of balance has not yet occurred. Put bluntly, the 'new balance' discussed at the start of this paper, is one where self-orientation among CEOs is developing well ahead of organisational awareness that high and enduring loyalty levels may no longer be expected from senior staff. With responsibility for HR planning and development in the hands of volunteers rather than professionals - the organisations' boards of trustees - this may be inevitable and the impending organisational 'hurt' as job change among CEOs in the sector occurs more and more may be unavoidable.

For the 'rules of the game' to have been fully shifted, women CEOs will need not only to be able to sustain their self orientation in their careers but to gain posts in the larger and largest non-profits. However, when the studies of men CEOs are underway, a similar pattern to the women's experiences may be presented (or at least recounted to the female researchers). For HRD practitioners and academics, these developments point to the need for increased awareness in the tensions facing smaller non-profits organisations, often exhorted to enhance their 'people policies'. In a period of recession and decline, when the need for human service organisations increases, it is ironic that the notion of 'upwards' career development may still be taking place in this sector when it is diminished or gone in the for- profits fields. Yet the opportunities for non-profits to capacity build in this area is limited. Funders seeking enhanced organisational performance from non-profits are urged to support, the HRD aspirations and opportunities of women as well as men in this sector; and to recognise the possibility of more volatile performance from those organisations, where women CEOs are giving primacy to their own rather than their employing organisation's career needs.

References

Adamson, S.J, Doherty, N. & Viney, C. (1998). The meanings of career revisited: implications for theory and practice. *British Journal of Management*, 9(4), 251-259.

Alcock, P., Harrow, J. Macmillan, R., Vincent, J & Pearson, S. (forthcoming). *Making funding work*. York, UK: York Publishing.

Arthur, M.B. Hall, D.T. & Lawrence, B.S. (Eds.). (1989). *Handbook of career theory*. London: Cambridge University Press

Dawson,R (1998). *Gender and chief executives in the voluntary sector*. Middlesex:, UK: Midland Bank and ACENVO.

Dex,S. (1985). *The sexual division of work*, Brighton, UK: Wheatsheaf.

Evetts,J. (1992). Dimensions of career: Avoiding reification in the analysis of change. *Sociology*, *26*(1), 1-21.

Evetts,J. (1994). *Women and career: Themes and issues in advanced industrial societies*. Longman Group UK Ltd.

Harrow , J. (1998). *Capacity Building' in public policy: working concept or well-meaning catch-phrase?* Centre for Voluntary Organisation 20th Anniversary Symposium, 'Third Sector Organisation in a Changing Policy Context', London School of Economics and Political Science, London, 17-18 September.

Hirsch,W, Jackson, C. & Jackson,C (1995). *Careers in organisations: Issues for the future* (IES Report 287) UK: Brighton: Institute for Employment Studies.

Inkson, K. (1995) Effects of changing economic conditions on managerial job changes and career. *British Journal of Management*, 6(3), 183-194.

Hilderbrand, M. E. & Grindle, M.S. (1997). Building sustainable capacity in the public sector: What can be done?' in M.S. Grindle Ed., *Getting good government: Capacity building in the public sectors of developing countries*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Lieblich, A., Tuval-Mashiach, R., and Zilber, Y. T. (1998), *Narrative research, reading, analysis and interpretation*. London: Sage.

Marshall, C. & Rossman, G. B. (1989). *Designing qualitative research*. London: Sage.

Ohiorhenuan, J. & Wunker, S. (1995). *Capacity building requirements for global environmental protection* (Working Paper 12). UNDP, UNEP and the World Bank.

Patton, M.Q. (1980) *Qualitative research methods*. London: Sage.

Torbert, W. & Fisher, D. (1992). Autobiographical awareness as a catalyst for managerial and organisational learning. *Management Education and Development* *23*(3), 184-198.

Career Development Of Expatriate Managers: An International HRD Issue For Singapore-Based Companies.

AAhad M. Osman-Gani
Gerald Z.D. Huang
Nanyang Technological University, Singapore

Expatriate human resource development is poised to play a major role in determining the success or failure of companies seeking to do business across national borders. This has become more critical with the onset of the knowledge economy. For Singapore companies, the regionalisation drive initiated a few years ago, and the eventual integration of the ASEAN market makes it imperative that companies begin to focus on developing human resource for the regional and international web. In the international HRD literature, expatriate career development did not receive proper attention, although it is a significant issue for effective expatriate performance. This paper presents some empirical information from a recent study conducted on expatriate development in Singapore.

Key Words: Expatriate Career Development, Singapore, Asia

Today, people create national and organizational competitiveness, compared to earlier suggestions of classical economic theorists that mere access to advantageous factors of production can make the difference (Kindleberger, 1970; Porter, 1990). People invent and utilise technology, people formulate and implement strategy and people design and build organization structures. In today's global marketplace, to get the right people with the right skills inventing and utilizing technology, formulating and implementing strategy, and designing and building organization structure at the right place and at the right time, movement is needed – movement of people across national borders (Black, Gregersen and Mendenhall, 1992). Yet, human resource systems remain one of the major constraints in implementing global strategies. This is more significant for multinational companies (MNCs) operating in today's global business environment. Although much has been written on international human resource management, very little research has been done on international HRD, specifically on career development of managers responsible for international business operations (Tung, 1988; Harvey, 1989; Black, Gregersen & Mendenhall, 1992). From a review of the literature, career can be defined as "the pattern of work-related experiences that span the course of a person's life" (Greenhaus, 1987) and career development looks at the long-term career effectiveness and success of organizational personnel (Cenzo and Robbins, 1994). According to French (1994), career development programs represent efforts to increase the organization's present and future ability to meet its goals by providing educational and development experiences for managers above and beyond the immediate technical requirements of their jobs.

As companies extend their international reach, the increasing importance of such overseas operations can place the success or failure of their international initiatives in the hands of their expatriate managers (Bennett, 1993; Foxman and Polsky, 1991; Mendenhall and Oddou, 1991). To become truly global, MNCs need to begin linking their HR practices to company-wide strategic objectives. Evans (1993) suggests that international HR practices may serve as 'glue' which can be used to link the management of personnel to the development of the organization as a whole. The linkage of global strategy and international HR practice should be born out of the realisation that the power to become a truly global firm rests with the organization's HRM. Studies show that a significant number of expatriate managers fail in their duties, to the great expense of their employers. Tung (1987) found that, of the 80 US MNCs surveyed, half had expatriate failure rates exceeding 30 per cent. The average cost of each failure to the parent company was estimated 10 years ago at between $250,000 to $1 million (Copeland and Griggs, 1985). As a result, American firms may lose at least $2 billion a year (Caudron, 1991). These figures suggest that in order to be successful in the international business arena, corporations must begin addressing the HR issues which accompany the use of expatriate managers. In most instances, positive changes in skill levels experienced by the expatriate even went unnoticed and unused (Adler, 1986; Bennett, 1993; Mendenhall and Oddou, 1991; Tung, 1984). This can lead to negative consequences for the organization and MNCs may deprive themselves of excellent resources to aid them in the globalization process (Bennett, 1993). As such, career development planning, involving global and cross-cultural training, becomes necessary for managers in today's organizations, regardless of their domestic or international assignments (Osman-Gani, 1996; Marquardt and Engel, 1993; Odenwald, 1993; Reynolds and Nadler, 1993; Johnston, 1991; Rhinesmith, 1991).

Copyright © 1999 Aahad M. Osman-Gani and Gerald Z.D. Huang

Reviewing the literature on international HRD, very little work could be identified in the area of expatriate career development. Naumann (1993) suggests that the extent to which MNCs provide well defined career paths for expatriates may serve as a signal of the organization's commitment to them. Evidence indicate the extent to which expatriates saw their assignment as benefitting their careers was significantly related to their intent to leave the firm. Communicating the recognition that the expatriate assignment is vital to both the success of the MNC and to the expatriate's career, the MNC can provide validation of the expatriate experience (Adler, 1986). The more the MNC allows its expatriates to see a clear relationship between consecutive job assignments, the more time and energy they will be willing to invest on behalf of the organization (Feldman and Thomas, 1992). Furthermore, the use of expatriate experience in the creation of logical career paths is an important way in which MNCs can utilise the development of international experience among its human resources as a mechanism for fulfilling globally-oriented corporate strategies.

Survey results of 46 US multinational corporations (Handler, Lane and Maher, 1997) indicate that expatriate career-planning issues are salient concerns, consistent with literature establishing that such issues should be of major concern to MNCs (Adler, 1986; Bennett, 1993; Feldman, 1991; Feldman and Thomas, 1992; Nicholson et al, 1990; Mendenhall and Oddou, 1991). The results also suggest that few MNCs have policies to assist with expatriate career planning and that much of the assistance currently offered falls short of the needs of the MNC's expatriate HR. Findings reveal a gap between the importance of career planning issues and the level of career-planning policy currently available.

As expatriate development is becoming a key HRD issue in the dynamic Asia Pacific region, this needs to be accorded much more importance (Osman-Gani and Tan, 1998). Until the recent financial crisis (since the last quarter of 1997), East Asia was one of the fastest growing regions in the world. According to the UN World Economic Survey, East Asia grew by an annual average rate of 4.5% during the last decade, while ASEAN's (Association of South East Asian Nations) average was at 6.8%. The comparable rate for the US was 1.4% and 1.7% for Europe. ASEAN member countries were ranked among the world's largest hosts of foreign direct investment inflows. At the same time they are becoming significant foreign investors themselves, mostly in other less-developed Asian countries. The OECD has projected the Asia-Pacific to grow by 5-6% to the year 2010. On the other hand, the comparable rates for North America and Europe were set at 2-5% and 3-4% respectively. While much has been written on expatriate selection, training and development in general, very little was documented on career development of expatriates from different national and cultural backgrounds working in Asia. With Asian economies ready to take centre stage in the twenty-first century, despite the recent financial crisis, it is logical that we should have a better understanding of the expatriate development issues, for effective expatriate performance in Asia. Furthermore, no empirical study could be identified that investigated expatriate career development in the Asia Pacific region. There seems to be a research gap in the international HRD literature from this perspective.

This paper presents some empirical results from a recent study conducted in Singapore. The study investigated expatriate career development, from the perspective of multinational corporations based in Singapore and local companies with overseas operations. Singapore plays a key position in the agenda of most multinational corporation's planning to do business in Asia, and is one of the sought after locations for siting regional headquarters. Additionally, this issue is particularly relevant to local companies because of the regionalisation drive that is being promoted by the Singapore Government.

Research Questions:

This study attempts to address the following research questions:

1. What is the status of companies using career development plans for expatriates in Singapore?
2. Where does responsibility for the planning and designing of career development plans for expatriates reside in the organisation?
3. What are the key features of an expatriate career development plan?
4. How frequently are such career development plans reviewed?
5. .How does repatriation issues feature in the career development plan?

Research Methodology:

This study used an exploratory research design and followed a survey methodology. A national survey was conducted on a sample of MNCs based in Singapore and local companies having overseas operations. A

questionnaire was developed based on the findings of an extensive literature review and the feedback from sample interviews with selected managers of Singapore-based companies. The questionnaire was pilot tested on a group of 40 managers, of whom 25 were from MNCs. The questionnaire was tested for reliability and validity using the responses from the pilot sample, and using a panel of experts consisting of faculty members in the Nanyang Business School, Nanyang Technological University. The final questionnaire was administered using local mail and personal administration procedures. Two follow-up measures used were, telephone calls and facsimile system. Using proportionate stratified random sampling procedure, a sample size of 400 companies was selected from the "Singapore 1000 database; comprising 300 MNCs and 100 local companies with overseas operations. The overall response rate was 23%, which is considered to be normal for this type of study in Singapore.

Results

Respondent's Profile

Respondents of this study are senior managers from MNCs and local companies based in Singapore. About 77% of the respondents are from MNCs and a large proportion (39.3%) came from the manufacturing sector, followed by the financial and business services sector (21.4%). The respondent companies, by country of parent company origin, can be classified as American (12.1%), European (24.2%), Asian-excluding Singapore, (45.5%) and Singaporean (18.2%). A large percentage of the Asian companies are Japanese firms. The majority of respondents falls into the age group of 30 to 50, with 41.2% aged between 30 to less than 40 years' old, and 38.2% aged between 40 to less than 50 years' old. In terms of service, 47.1% of the managers have been with the company for less than 5 years and 26.5% of the respondents having served between 5 to 10 years. The respondents are quite evenly distributed among the various levels of management: 35.3% in top management, 44.1% in the middle and 20.6% in line management.

Research question 1: What is the status of companies using career development plans for expatriates in Singapore?

Table 1 presents the findings in order to respond to the above research question.

Table 1
Percentage of Companies (By Continent) With Separate Expatriate Career Development Plan

Expatriate Career Development Programs	America	Europe	Asia (-Sing)	Singapore	Total
Yes	8%	12%	33%	9%	62%
No	4%	12%	13%	9%	38%
Total	12%	24%	46%	18%	100%

It can be observed from the above table that 62% of the companies have a separate career development plan for expatriates, of which about 42% were Asian MNCs (Japanese, Korean and Singaporean). This appears to contradict general expectations that the Western MNCs have more established career development plans. The high percentage registered by Asian MNCs could be the result of the increased internalisation drive while the Americans and Europeans, on the other hand, scored low probably because they had longer experience in the international scene and had already started their localisation program.

Research question 2: Where does responsibility for the planning and designing of career development plans for expatriates reside in the organization?

The research findings to respond to the above question are presented in Table 2.

Table 2
Responsibility of Planning Expatriate Career Development (By Continent)

Management Level	America	Europe	Asia (-Singapore)	Singapore	Total
Top Mgmt	0%	14%	24%	10%	48%
HR&Functional Mgmt	0%	0%	4.5%	0%	4.5%
Top Mgmt & HR Mgmt	9.5%	0%	14%	0%	23.5%
Top Mgmt & Functional Mgt	4.5%	0%	0%	0%	4.5%
Team Mgmt*	0%	5%	9.5%	5%	19.5%
Total	14%	19%	52%	15%	100%

*Denotes the combined effort of top management, human resource management and functional management.

It is clear from the above table that expatriate career development receives high level attention, with close to half the respondents citing top management involvement. Again, the percentages do suggest a higher rate of participation by Asian and Singaporean top management due probably to the recent internalization drive. For the Americans, because of the long experience in expatriation, the planning function has been delegated to the Human Resource and functional department managers. Also worth noting is the high percentage (23.5%) registered jointly by top and human resource management in planning expatriate career development It could be a possible indication that human resource practitioners have begun to be involved in strategic management areas. Another interesting finding from this study revealed that MNCs from Europe and Asia tend to develop their career development plans at the overseas subsidiary locations. This could be due to the fact that companies begin to realise that to be global, they must also be 'local' and accord due importance to the national context.

Research question 3: What are the key features of an expatriate career development plan?

Table 3
Major Features of Companies Career Development Plan for Expatriates (By Continent)

Features of Expatriate Career Development Plans	America		Europe		Asia (excluding Singapore)		Singapore		Overall	
	Mean*	Std. Deviation	Mean*	Std. Deviation	Mean*	Std. Deviation	Mean*	Std. Deviation	Mean*	Std. Deviation
Extensive cross-border relations training	4.00	1.00	2.00	1.15	3.27	1.27	2.33	2.08	3.00	1.41
Promotion before overseas assignment	2.00	1.00	2.25	0.96	2.55	1.51	2.33	0.58	2.38	1.20
Promotion to key positions upon repatriation	3.67	1.15	3.25	1.26	3.36	1.21	3.00	1.00	3.33	1.11
Higher authority and responsibility	4.00	1.00	4.00	0.82	3.64	1.43	3.67	0.58	3.76	1.14
Other overseas assignments	3.67	0.58	3.25	1.71	2.91	1.14	3.67	0.58	3.19	1.12

(* 1= least frequently used,..... 5= most frequently used)

The above table presents the findings in response to the above research question and show that cross cultural training (cross-border relations) featured prominently in the expatriate career development plan. A list of five features was given to the companies and they were asked to rate the features from a scale of 0 to 5, where 0 means not used, 1 means least frequently used and 5 means most frequently used. As we can see from Table 3.0, the two most common features among MNCs and Singapore companies are promotion to key positions upon repatriation (3.00 to 3.67) and higher authority and responsibility (3.64 to 4.00). The companies from America and Asia are found to also frequently use extensive cross-border relations training as one of their career development features. Consistent with the origins of most researches, the Americans are aware of the great variety in cultures and thus provide cross-culture training. At the same time, Asian companies from a continental region where cultures differ greatly from country to country, have appreciated the need to provide such training for their expatriates. On the other hand, Singapore companies, like European companies, continue to utilize their expatriate's expertise in giving them more overseas assignments (3.67 and 3.25).

Research question 4: How frequently are such career development plans reviewed?

Table 4 Presents the findings in response to the above question.

Table 4

Frequency Of Expatriate Career Development Plan Review (By Continent)

Duration	America	Europe	Asia(-Sing)	Singapore	Total
Less Than 1 Year	0%	10%	14%	4.5%	28.5%
1 To Less Than 2 Years	14%	4.5%	4.5%	10%	33.0%
2 To Less Than 4 Years	0%	4.5%	29%	0%	33.5%
4 To Less Than 6 Years	0%	0%	5%	0%	5.0%
Total	14%	19%	52.5%	14.5%	100%

The above table shows that expatriate career plans are reviewed at different frequencies: 1 to 2 years for American companies, within a year for some European and Asian companies while others range from 2 to less than 6 years. These could be due to differences in emphases placed by various companies depending on the nature of business, or it could be reflective of the level of stability of expatriate development. However, considering the dynamic nature of international business in the Asia-Pacific region, expatriate career development plans should be reviewed more frequently. The Asian companies surveyed showed a significant percentage of 14% review their expatriate career development plans at least once a year which is indicative of the growing importance of the issue.

Research question 5: How does repatriation issues feature in the career development plan?

Table 5
Measures Used For Effective Repatriation (By Continent)

Repatriation Measures Used	America		Europe		Asia (excluding Singapore)		Singapore		Overall	
	Mean*	Std. Deviation	Mean*	Std. Deviation	Mean*	Std. Deviation	Mean*	Std. Deviation	Mean*	Std. Deviation
Arranging proper job placement for expatriate before return to parent country	4.25	0.96	3.63	2.26	3.60	1.40	3.33	1.75	3.59	1.62
Allowing greater autonomy in decision-making	3.00	1.41	2.38	1.51	2.60	1.35	2.83	1.47	2.56	1.42
Arranging a homecoming event	1.25	1.50	2.00	1.41	1.87	1.55	1.50	1.64	1.71	1.49
Orientation programs to familiarize returning expatriates with changes	2.25	1.26	2.25	1.98	2.80	1.66	2.33	1.97	2.56	1.69
Offer repatriation counseling to family for ease of adjustment	2.00	1.63	1.13	1.13	2.87	1.73	1.83	1.72	2.21	1.68
Early notification of return to parent country	3.50	1.00	2.75	1.83	3.33	1.76	4.17	0.41	3.41	1.56
Exposure to career development plans before repatriation	3.50	0.58	2.63	2.26	2.93	1.67	2.83	2.23	2.94	1.77

(*1=least frequently used, 5= most frequently used)

From the above table, it can be seen that repatriation plans were found to be a major aspect of the expatriate career development program. Generally, all companies placed high emphasis on proper job placement before the expatriate returns to the parent country (3.59). It can also be noted that the European and Asian companies are also involving their expatriates in career development plans before repatriation. With the growth in globalisation, the implication for researchers and practitioners is that perhaps, it is time that greater attention is paid to this area. Existing literature are rooted in the American experience and for cultural and other reasons, may not be entirely appropriate for expatriate career development in Asia.

Conclusions

As expatriate assignments heavily impact on the bottom line of any overseas operations, they must not be viewed lightly. Moreover, the success of any international venture depends to a large extent, on the ability of the expatriate managers to contribute in different socio-economic environments and hence help grow the business. For this, expatriates should be provided a clear direction of their career development, from initial expatriate assignment to repatriation. Companies should begin to translate the importance of this issue into sound business policies in order to facilitate future success and growth of international ventures,

For future researchers, this study may provide the headway into the area of expatriate career development. Of special relevance, is a more focused study on the need to synchronise the strategic objectives of the corporations for overseas expansion with the career aspirations of the individual managers.

The findings of this exploratory study will help to contribute to the body of knowledge in International HRD by way of adding new dimensions of thinking for improving expatriate performance, especially in the dynamic region of Asia, through using the descriptive information (with relevant empirical data) presented in the paper. Results from this study will help in developing new research questions/hypotheses for future research. Future

researchers may find this paper useful for linking expatriate career development issues to other aspects of HRD for effective expatriate performance (specifically in the Asia-Pacific region). The theories of HRD drawn from various disciplines could be used in developing a conceptual framework for studying the expatriate performance improvement (linking training, career development and other non-training issues), which is not available in the current international management literature. This will be a demanding area for research as well as for professional practice in today's dynamic global business environment.

Limitations of the Study

As this study only covers MNCs and local companies based in Singapore, the findings may, to some extent, be influenced by the local environment and therefore may not be representative of progress in other countries.

Due to the current economic crisis in Asia, companies were not very willing to participate in this kind of study, citing reasons of time spent on damage control and confidentiality. The relatively small size of respondents hopefully does not affect the true representation of the population for making some generalisation.

References:

Adler, N. 1986. International Dimensions of Organisational Behavior, Boston, MA: Kent.

Bennett, R., 1993. 'Meeting the Challenges of Repatriation', Journal of International Compensation and Benefits, September/October.

Black, J.S., Gregersen, H.B., and Mendenhall, M. 1992. 'Toward a Theoretical Framework of Repatriation Adjustment,' Journal of International Business Studies, Fourth Quarter, pp. 737-760

Caudron, S., 1991. 'Training Ensures Success Overseas'. Personnel Journal, Vol. 70, 27-30.

Copeland, L. and Griggs, L. 1985. Going International, New York, Random House.

De Cenzo, D A and Robbins, S P. 1994, Human Resource Management-Concepts and Practices, John Wiley & Sons.

Evans, PA.L 1993. 'Dosing The Glue: Applying Human Resource Technology To Build The Global Organisation. Research in Personnel and Human Resource Management.

Feldman, D.C. and Thomas, D.C. 1992. 'Career Management Issues Facing Expatriates'. Journal of International Business Studies, Vol. 23, 271-293.

Foxman, L.D. and Polsky, W.L. 1991. 'HR Approaches For The Age of Globalisation.' Personnel Journal, Vol. 70, 38-41.

French W L. 1994. Human Resources Management Houghton Mifflin Company

Greenhaus, J H 1987. Career Management. New York: Dryden Press.

Handler, Lane and Maher. 1997. Human Resource Management Journal; London.

Harvey, M.G. 1989. 'Repatriation of Corporate Executives: An Empirical Study,' Journal of International Business Studies, Vol. 20, pp. 131-144.

Johnston, W.B. 1991. Global Workforce 2000: The New World Labor Market. Harvard Business Review, March-April: 115-127.

Kindleberger, C.P. 1970. 'The International Corporation: Theory of Foreign Direct Investment,'. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press

Marquardt, M3. And Engel, D.E. 1993 Global Human Resource Development. Englewood Cliffs, NJ. Prentice Hall, Inc.

Mendenhall, M.E. and Oddou, G.R. 1991. 'Succession Planning for the 21st century: How Well Are We Grooming Our Expatriates?' Business Horizons, Jan-Feb, 26-34.

Naumann, E. 1993. 'Antecedents and Consequences of Satisfaction and Commitment Among Expatriate Managers. Group and Organization Management, Vol 18, no. 2, 153-187.

Odenwald,S.V. 1993. Global Training: How to Design a Program for the Multinational Corporation. Alexandria, VA: The American Society for Training and Development

Osman-Gani, A.M. and Tan, W.L. 1998. 'Asian Expatriate Development: A Comparative Analysis of Japanese, Korean and Singaporean Expatriates'. Proceedings for the 1998 AIB Annual Conference held in Vienna (October 7-11).

Osman-Gani, A.M., 1996. 'International Human Resource Development.' In G. Thong eds. Human Resource Issues in Singapore, Chapter 14. Singapore: Addison-Wesley Publishing Co.

Porter, M.E., 1990. The Competitive Advantage of Nations. The Free Press, New York.

Reynolds, S. and Nadler, L. 1993. Globalisation: The International HRD Consultant and Practitioner. Amherst, MA: Human Resource Development Press.

Rhinesmith, S.H. 1991. An agenda for Globalisation: Training and Development Journal, Febuary: 22-29

Tung, R.L. 1987. 'Exaptriate Assignments: Enhancing Success and Minimizing Failure'. Academy of Management Executive, Vol. 1, 117-126.

Tung, R.L. 1988. 'Career Issues in International Assignments,' Academy of Management Executive, 2(3). pp. 241-244.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE